

In Re Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi & Limousine Commission
October 18, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X
NEW YORK CITY
TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING
-----X

October 18, 2023
10:06 a.m.

HELD AT
33 BEAVER STREET
NEW YORK, NEW YORK

B E F O R E:
DAVID DO
COMMISSIONER AND CHAIR

Reporter: Elbia Brumit

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S:

TLC COMMISSIONERS:

COMMISSIONER DAVID DO

COMMISSIONER SARAH KAUFMAN

COMMISSIONER THOMAS SORRENTINO

COMMISSIONER KENNETH C. MITCHELL

COMMISSIONER PAUL BADER

GENERAL COUNSEL SHERRYL ELUTO

FABIAN CANCEL, DIRECTOR OF BASE/BUSINESS SERVICES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIR DO: Good morning. I am calling this meeting to order at 10:06 a.m. I am David Do, Commissioner and Chair of the Taxi and Limousine Commission. It's great to see everyone in person this morning. And I'm joined today by the board of commissioners, Commissioner Kaufman, Commissioner Sorrentino, Commissioner Mitchell and Commissioner Bader.

A few words before we get onto our votes. We have a rule proposal up for a vote today that can improve the life of our city. Our Green Rides Initiative. If passed, New York will become the first large city in America to require its rideshare fleet to be either wheelchair accessible or zero emissions by 2030.

"Being the first" is a phrase we use a lot in New York City. But we are not proposing this to be the first. We are proposing this because our world is slipping deeper into a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

climate crisis. According to the National Oceanic Atmospheric Administration, 2023 is about to surpass 2016 as the hottest year on record. We are breaking records like this regularly. We have a chance to do something about it.

We are at a crossroads at which with the widespread adoption of new technology allows us to embark on a more responsible path towards cleaner air, a safer and more accessible city. And a more hopeful future. This rule will not be fully implemented overnight. No one will be forced to buy a zero-emissions vehicle or a wheelchair-accessible vehicle tomorrow, next week or even next month.

Drivers will transition when the time is right for them. In tandem with developing charging infrastructure and price parity with ICE vehicles. We may be the first,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

but I'm fully confident that as we begin to reap the rewards of this transition, it will become abundantly clear that we will not be the last. On that note, let's get onto our votes.

Today we are voting on two rule proposals. The first rule will change the payment structure for the Verrazano-Narrows Bridge tolls. Our original rule proposal required that the passenger would pay double the toll going into Staten Island, and a new passenger would pay the toll to leave Staten Island. After reviewing public comment, the final rule proposal would ask the passenger to pay double toll to enter Staten Island and no toll to leave, reverting to the toll system that used to be in place.

In addition, this payment scheme would also apply to passengers using the Cross Bay Veterans Bridge and the Marine Parkway-Gil Hodges Memorial

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Bridge to enter Rockaway Peninsula, as there is no way to exit the Rockaways without using the bridge.

The second rule proposal establishes our Green Rides Initiative, which would require high volume for-hire vehicles services, such as Uber and Lyft, to dispatch vehicles that are 100 percent either zero-emission or wheelchair-accessible by 2030. The rules establish a ramp schedule at five percent to dispatch to such vehicles in 2024, and slowly ramps up to 100 percent in 2030.

After reviewing public comment, the final version of the rule is the same as proposed except for one change: Data collection will not include the VIN of the vehicle's dispatch.

Before I go onto the votes, I would like to recognize Commissioner Kaufman for some comments.

MS. KAUFMAN: Thank you,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Commissioner Do.

Before we vote, I would like to say I'm so glad that New York is working to be first in this initiative to develop a solution for both sustainable and accessible transportation. And I look forward to collaborating on this effort with you.

I would also like to acknowledge that much of the widespread adoption of electric vehicles to Taxi and Limousine Commission drivers is contingent on factors outside of this organization.

So while I vote yes today, I hope that a number -- the number of chargers that are publicly accessible and widely distributed and with sufficient uptime will be made available to keep pace with the adoption of these vehicles. And if they're not, within a couple of years I hope to move for a vote to amend the policy according to the pace of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

deployment of chargers.

Thanks.

CHAIR DO: Thank you,
Commissioner. I will now go to our
general counsel, Sheryl Eluto, to take
us through our agenda today.

MS. ELUTO: Good morning,
Commissioners.

The first item before you are
the minutes for the September 13, 2023
commission meeting.

I will call vote now to adopt
those minutes.

All in favor for adopting the
minutes, please raise your hands.
(Raised hands from Commissioners.)

MS. ELUTO: And the minutes are
adopted unanimously.

I will now call on Director of
Base and Business Services, Fabian
Cancel to present the base license
applications.

MR. CANCEL: Good morning,
Commissioners and attendees. My name

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

is Fabian Cancel, I'm the Director of
TLC Base and Business Services.

Four bases have been submitted
for your review and we are awaiting
your approval.

MS. ELUTO: Commissioners, can
we have a vote on adopting base
license recommendations? All in favor
of adopting, please raise your hands.
(Raised hands from Commissioners.)

MS. ELUTO: And thank you. The
motion is adopted unanimously.

MR. CANCEL: Thank you.

MS. ELUTO: Commissioners, we
now turn to item five on the agenda,
the Verrazzano-Narrows Bridge toll
rule proposal package.

The proposed rules were
published in the city record on
July 10, 2023 for public comment. A
public hearing was held by the TLC on
August 9th. And on October 13th, the
final version of the proposed rule was
posted on our website and circulated

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to the commissioners, along with hearing transcript and all written comments that we received.

Commissioners, may we move for a vote. All those in favor of adopting the rules amended, please raise your hand.

(Raised hands from Commissioners.)

MS. ELUTO: Great. The rule is adopted unanimously.

And, Commissioners, we now turn to item six on the agenda. Which will be the Green Rides Initiative. Give me one second -- I can tell you what day they were published in the city record --

Green Rides Initiative, they were published in the city record on August 16th for public comment, and on September 20, 2023, we held a public hearing. The final version was sent to the Commissioners and published on our website on October 13th. Can we now call for a vote?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Commissioners, how do we vote?
In favor?

CHAIR DO: Yes.

(Raised hands by Commissioners.)

MS. ELUTO: Yes. So the vote is
unanimous. Thank you very much.
David, Commissioner, any additional
business?

CHAIR DO: Well, this has been
an incredible day to see a unanimous
vote on such an important path towards
a more sustainable, accessible city.
I'm excited for the path forward, I'm
excited for the implementation and I'm
excited to work with all our
Commissioners to get to a greener
city.

And so thank you so much today
for your vote and commitment to our
city's future. And with that, the
time is now 10:13, and I'll adjourn
this meeting.

(TIME NOTED: 10:13 a.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF NASSAU)

I, Elbia Brumit, a Notary Public within
and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

I reported the proceedings in the
within-entitled matter, and that the within
transcript is a true record of such proceedings to
the best of my ability.

I further certify that I am not related
to any of the parties to this action by blood or
marriage; and that I am in no way interested in
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set
my hand this 26th day of October, 2023.


ELBIA BRUMIT

<p>& 4</p> <p>13th 9:23 10:24</p> <p>16th 10:20</p> <p>26th 12:19</p> <p>9th 9:23</p> <p>ability 12:13</p> <p>about 4:4,8</p> <p>abundantly 5:4</p> <p>accessible 3:19 4:13 7:7,18 11:13 (5)</p> <p>according 4:2 7:25</p> <p>acknowledge 7:10</p> <p>action 12:15</p> <p>addition 5:22</p> <p>additional 11:8</p> <p>adjourn 11:22</p> <p>administration 4:4</p> <p>adopt 8:13</p> <p>adopted 8:19 9:13 10:11</p> <p>adopting 8:15 9:8,10 10:6 (4)</p> <p>adoption 4:10 7:11,22</p> <p>after 5:16 6:16</p> <p>agenda 8:7 9:16 10:13</p> <p>air 4:13</p> <p>allows 4:11</p> <p>along 10:2</p> <p>also 5:23 7:10</p>	<p>am 9 3:2,4,4 11:24 12:14,16 (7)</p> <p>amend 7:24</p> <p>amended 10:7</p> <p>america 3:17</p> <p>applications 8:23</p> <p>apply 5:23</p> <p>approval 9:6</p> <p>are 3:23,24 4:6,9 5:8 6:10 7:18 8:10,18 9:5 (10)</p> <p>ask 5:18</p> <p>atmospheric 4:3</p> <p>attendees 8:25</p> <p>august 9:23 10:20</p> <p>available 7:21</p> <p>awaiting 9:5</p> <p>b 17</p> <p>bader 2:9 3:11</p> <p>base 8:21,22 9:3,8 (4)</p> <p>basebusiness 2:12</p> <p>bases 9:4</p> <p>bay 5:24</p> <p>beaver 13</p> <p>because 3:24</p> <p>become 3:17 5:4</p> <p>before 3:12 6:22 7:3 8:10 (4)</p> <p>begin 5:3</p> <p>being 3:21</p>	<p>best 12:13</p> <p>blood 12:15</p> <p>board 3:8</p> <p>both 7:6</p> <p>breaking 4:6</p> <p>bridge 5:11,24 6:2,4 9:17 (5)</p> <p>brunit 22 12:8</p> <p>business 8:21 9:3 11:9</p> <p>buy 4:17</p> <p>c 2:2,8 12:2,2 (4)</p> <p>call 8:13,20 10:25</p> <p>calling 3:3</p> <p>can 3:14 9:7 10:15,24 (4)</p> <p>cancel 2:12 8:22,24 9:2,14 (5)</p> <p>certify 12:9,14</p> <p>chair 19 3:2,5 8:4 11:4,10 (6)</p> <p>chance 4:7</p> <p>change 5:9 6:19</p> <p>chargers 7:18 8:2</p> <p>charging 4:23</p> <p>circulated 9:25</p> <p>city 3 3:15,17,22 4:13 9:20 10:16,19 11:13,18 (10)</p> <p>city's 11:21</p> <p>cleaner 4:12</p> <p>clear 5:5</p> <p>climate 4:2</p>
---	---	---

<p>collaborating 7:9</p> <p>collection 6:19</p> <p>comment 5:17 6:16 9:21 10:20 (4)</p> <p>comments 6:24 10:4</p> <p>commission 4 3:6 7:13 8:12 (4)</p> <p>commissioner 19 2:5,6,7,8,9 3:5,9,10,10,11 6:23 7:2 8:5 11:8 (15)</p> <p>commissioners 2:4 3:9 8:9,17,25 9:7,11,15 10:2,5,9,12,23 11:2,5,17 (16)</p> <p>commitment 11:20</p> <p>confident 5:2</p> <p>contingent 7:14</p> <p>counsel 2:10 8:6</p> <p>county 12:6</p> <p>couple 7:23</p> <p>crisis 4:2</p> <p>cross 5:24</p> <p>crossroads 4:9</p> <p>data 6:19</p> <p>david 18 2:5 3:4 11:8 (4)</p> <p>day 10:16 11:11 12:19</p> <p>deeper 3:25</p> <p>deployment 8:2</p> <p>develop 7:6</p> <p>developing 4:23</p> <p>director 2:12 8:20 9:2</p>	<p>dispatch 6:9,13,21</p> <p>distributed 7:19</p> <p>double 5:13,19</p> <p>drivers 4:21 7:13</p> <p>e 17,17 2:2,2 12:2,2 (6)</p> <p>effort 7:9</p> <p>either 3:19 6:10</p> <p>elbia 22 12:8</p> <p>electric 7:12</p> <p>eluto 2:10 8:6,8,18 9:7,12,15 10:10 11:6 (9)</p> <p>embark 4:11</p> <p>emissions 3:20</p> <p>enter 5:19 6:2</p> <p>establish 6:12</p> <p>establishes 6:6</p> <p>even 4:19</p> <p>everyone 3:7</p> <p>except 6:18</p> <p>excited 11:14,15,16</p> <p>exit 6:3</p> <p>f 17 12:2</p> <p>fabian 2:12 8:21 9:2</p> <p>factors 7:14</p> <p>favor 8:15 9:9 10:6 11:3 (4)</p> <p>few 3:12</p> <p>final 5:17 6:17 9:24 10:22 (4)</p>	<p>first 3:17,21,24 4:25 5:9 7:5 8:10 (7)</p> <p>five 6:13 9:16</p> <p>fleet 3:18</p> <p>forced 4:16</p> <p>forhire 6:8</p> <p>forward 7:8 11:14</p> <p>four 9:4</p> <p>fully 4:15 5:2</p> <p>further 12:14</p> <p>future 4:14 11:21</p> <p>general 2:10 8:6</p> <p>get 3:12 5:6 11:17</p> <p>give 10:14</p> <p>glad 7:4</p> <p>go 6:22 8:5</p> <p>going 5:14</p> <p>good 3:2 8:8,24</p> <p>great 3:6 10:10</p> <p>green 3:15 6:6 10:14,18 (4)</p> <p>greener 11:17</p> <p>hand 10:8 12:19</p> <p>hands 8:16,17 9:10,11 10:9 11:5 (6)</p> <p>has 11:10</p> <p>hearing 9:22 10:3,22</p> <p>held 12 9:22 10:21</p> <p>hereby 12:9</p>
---	--	---

<p>hereunto 12:18</p> <p>high 6:7</p> <p>hodges 5:25</p> <p>hope 7:17,24</p> <p>hopeful 4:14</p> <p>hottest 4:5</p> <p>how 11:2</p> <p>i'll 11:22</p> <p>i'm 3:8 5:2 7:4 9:2 11:14,14,15 (7)</p> <p>ice 4:25</p> <p>implementation 11:15</p> <p>implemented 4:15</p> <p>important 11:12</p> <p>improve 3:14</p> <p>include 6:20</p> <p>incredible 11:11</p> <p>infrastructure 4:24</p> <p>initiative 3:16 6:7 7:5 10:14,18 (5)</p> <p>interested 12:16</p> <p>into 3:25 5:14</p> <p>is 3:21,25 4:4,22 6:3,17 7:4,13 9:2,13 10:10 11:6,22 12:12 (14)</p> <p>island 5:14,16,19</p> <p>item 8:10 9:16 10:13</p> <p>its 3:18</p> <p>joined 3:8</p>	<p>july 9:21</p> <p>kaufman 2:6 3:9 6:24,25 (4)</p> <p>keep 7:21</p> <p>kenneth 2:8</p> <p>large 3:17</p> <p>last 5:5</p> <p>leave 5:16,20</p> <p>let's 5:6</p> <p>license 8:22 9:9</p> <p>life 3:15</p> <p>like 4:6 6:23 7:3,10 (4)</p> <p>limousine 4 3:6 7:13</p> <p>look 7:8</p> <p>lot 3:22</p> <p>lyft 6:9</p> <p>made 7:20</p> <p>marine 5:25</p> <p>marriage 12:16</p> <p>matter 12:11,17</p> <p>may 4:25 10:5</p> <p>me 10:15</p> <p>meeting 5 3:3 8:12 11:23 (4)</p> <p>memorial 5:25</p> <p>minutes 8:11,14,16,18 (4)</p> <p>mitchell 2:8 3:11</p> <p>month 4:20</p> <p>more 4:12,13,14 11:13 (4)</p>	<p>morning 3:2,7 8:8,24 (4)</p> <p>motion 9:13</p> <p>move 7:24 10:5</p> <p>ms 6:25 8:8,18 9:7,12,15 10:10 11:6 (8)</p> <p>much 7:11 11:7,19</p> <p>my 8:25 12:13,19</p> <p>n 2:2</p> <p>name 8:25</p> <p>nassau 12:6</p> <p>national 4:3</p> <p>new 3,14,14 3:16,22 4:10 5:15 7:4 12:4,9 (10)</p> <p>next 4:19,19</p> <p>no 4:16 5:20 6:3 12:16 (4)</p> <p>notary 12:8</p> <p>note 5:6</p> <p>noted 11:24</p> <p>now 8:5,13,20 9:16 10:12,25 11:22 (7)</p> <p>number 7:17,17</p> <p>o 17</p> <p>oceanic 4:3</p> <p>october 8 9:23 10:24 12:19 (4)</p> <p>one 4:16 6:18 10:15</p> <p>onto 3:12 5:6 6:22</p> <p>order 3:3</p> <p>organization 7:15</p>
---	---	--

<p>original 5:12</p> <p>our 3:13,15,15,25 5:6,11 6:6 8:5,7 9:25 10:24 11:16,20 (13)</p> <p>outcome 12:17</p> <p>outside 7:14</p> <p>overnight 4:16</p> <p>p 2:2,2</p> <p>pace 7:21,25</p> <p>package 9:18</p> <p>parity 4:24</p> <p>parkway 5:25</p> <p>parties 12:15</p> <p>passed 3:16</p> <p>passenger 5:13,15,18</p> <p>passengers 5:23</p> <p>path 4:12 11:12,14</p> <p>paul 2:9</p> <p>pay 5:13,15,19</p> <p>payment 5:10,22</p> <p>peninsula 6:2</p> <p>percent 6:10,13,15</p> <p>person 3:7</p> <p>phrase 3:21</p> <p>place 5:21</p> <p>please 8:16 9:10 10:7</p> <p>policy 7:25</p> <p>posted 9:25</p>	<p>present 8:22</p> <p>price 4:24</p> <p>proceedings 12:10,12</p> <p>proposal 3:13 5:12,18 6:5 9:18 (5)</p> <p>proposals 5:9</p> <p>proposed 6:18 9:19,24</p> <p>proposing 3:23,24</p> <p>public 5 5:17 6:16 9:21,22 10:20,21 12:8 (8)</p> <p>publicly 7:18</p> <p>published 9:20 10:16,19,23 (4)</p> <p>r 17 2:2 12:2</p> <p>raise 8:16 9:10 10:7</p> <p>raised 8:17 9:11 10:9 11:5 (4)</p> <p>ramp 6:12</p> <p>ramps 6:15</p> <p>reap 5:3</p> <p>received 10:4</p> <p>recognize 6:23</p> <p>recommendations 9:9</p> <p>record 4:6 9:20 10:17,19 12:12 (5)</p> <p>records 4:6</p> <p>regularly 4:7</p> <p>related 12:14</p> <p>reported 12:10</p> <p>reporter 22</p>	<p>require 3:18 6:7</p> <p>required 5:12</p> <p>responsible 4:12</p> <p>reverting 5:20</p> <p>review 9:5</p> <p>reviewing 5:16 6:16</p> <p>rewards 5:3</p> <p>rides 3:15 6:6 10:14,18 (4)</p> <p>rideshare 3:18</p> <p>right 4:22</p> <p>rockaway 6:2</p> <p>rockaways 6:3</p> <p>rule 3:13 4:14 5:8,9,12,17 6:5,17 9:18,24 10:10 (11)</p> <p>rules 6:12 9:19 10:7</p> <p>s 2:2</p> <p>safer 4:13</p> <p>same 6:18</p> <p>sarah 2:6</p> <p>say 7:4</p> <p>schedule 6:13</p> <p>scheme 5:22</p> <p>second 6:5 10:15</p> <p>see 3:7 11:11</p> <p>sent 10:22</p> <p>september 8:11 10:21</p> <p>services 2:12 6:8 8:21 9:3 (4)</p>
---	--	---

set 12:18	technology 4:11	up 3:13 6:15
sherryl 2:10	tell 10:15	uptime 7:20
sheryl 8:6	thank 6:25 8:4 9:12,14 11:7,19 (6)	us 4:11 8:7
signature 12:22	thanks 8:3	use 3:22
six 10:13	them 4:22	used 5:21
slipping 3:25	these 7:22	using 5:23 6:4
slowly 6:14	they're 7:23	vehicle 4:17,18
so 7:4,16 11:6,19,19 (5)	thomas 2:7	vehicle's 6:20
solution 7:6	those 8:14 10:6	vehicles 4:25 6:8,10,14 7:12,22 (6)
some 6:24	through 8:7	verrazanonarrows 5:11
something 4:8	time 4:22 11:22,24	verrazanonarrows 9:17
sorrentino 2:7 3:10	tlc 2:4 9:3,22	version 6:17 9:24 10:22
ss 12:5	today 3:8,14 5:8 7:16 8:7 11:19 (6)	very 11:7
state 12:4,9	toll 5:14,15,19,20,21 9:17 (6)	veterans 5:24
staten 5:14,16,19	tolls 5:11	vin 6:20
street 13	tomorrow 4:19	volume 6:8
structure 5:10	towards 4:12 11:12	vote 3:14 7:3,16,24 8:13 9:8 10:6,25 11:2,6,12,20 (12)
submitted 9:4	transcript 10:3 12:12	votes 3:13 5:7 6:22
such 6:9,14 11:12 12:12 (4)	transition 4:21 5:4	voting 5:8
sufficient 7:20	transportation 7:8	way 6:3 12:16
surpass 4:5	true 12:12	website 9:25 10:24
sustainable 7:7 11:13	turn 9:16 10:12	week 4:19
system 5:21	two 5:8	well 11:10
t 12:2,2	uber 6:9	what 10:15
take 8:6	unanimous 11:7,11	wheelchair 3:19
tandem 4:22	unanimously 8:19 9:13 10:11	wheelchairaccessible 4:18
taxi 4 3:5 7:12		

<p>6:11</p> <p>when 4:21</p> <p>whereof 12:18</p> <p>which 4:9 6:7 10:13</p> <p>while 7:16</p> <p>widely 7:19</p> <p>widespread 4:10 7:11</p> <p>will 3:16 4:15,16,21 5:4,5,9 6:19 7:20 8:5,13,20 10:13 (13)</p> <p>within 7:23 12:8,11</p> <p>withintitled 12:11</p> <p>without 6:4</p> <p>witness 12:18</p> <p>words 3:12</p> <p>work 11:16</p> <p>working 7:5</p> <p>world 3:25</p> <p>would 5:13,15,18,23 6:7,23 7:3,10 (8)</p> <p>written 10:3</p> <p>x 2,6</p> <p>year 4:5</p> <p>years 7:23</p> <p>yes 7:16 11:4,6</p> <p>york 3,14,14 3:16,22 7:4 12:4,9 (8)</p> <p>your 8:16 9:5,6,10 10:7 11:20 (6)</p> <p>zero 3:19</p>	<p>zeroemission 6:11</p> <p>zeroemissions 4:17</p> <p>1006 9 3:4</p> <p>1013 11:22,24</p> <p>2016 4:5</p> <p>2023 8 4:4 8:11 9:21 10:21 12:19 (6)</p> <p>2024 6:14</p> <p>2030 3:20 6:12,15</p>	
--	---	--